

## The Evaluation of Plantation Development Policy in the City of Tidore Island

Isra Muksin

Universitas Bumi Hijrah Tidore, Indonesia

Correspondent: [isram23@unibrahtidore.ac.id](mailto:isram23@unibrahtidore.ac.id)

Received : May 27, 2023

Accepted : July 23, 2023

Published : July 31, 2023

Citation: Muksin, I. (2023). Evaluation of Plantation Development Policy in the City of Tidore Islands. *Ijomata International Journal of Social Science*, 4(3), 429-440.

<https://doi.org/10.52728/ijss.v4i3.873>

**ABSTRACT:** The purpose of this study is to evaluate the policy of providing assistance in the form of seeds for agriculture in Oba District, the city of Tidore Island. The research method used is descriptive qualitative in which an interview with 35 farmers from 12 villages and 1 sub-district is conducted. The results indicate that the policy on seeds provision to farmers in the city of of Tidore Island has been on target, yet it has not been successful due to inadequate support given concerning the ongoing guidance and supervision, therefore most of the seeds received are not planted. Another research finding is that the role of Gapoktan (Gabungan Kelompok Tani Farmers Group Association) in every village of Oba District is not optimum since access to information regarding facilities and infrastructure is limited.

**Keywords:** Evaluation, Policy, Plantation, Tidore



This is an open access article under the CC-BY 4.0 license

## INTRODUCTION

Every policy made and implemented by the local government must be analyzed before being implemented since it is intended to benefit people's livelihood. The agricultural sector has an important role because Indonesia is characterized by an agrarian country with abundant natural resource wealth. However, in practice, the agricultural sector has not made a positive contribution to the community's economy ([Hassan et al., 2020](#); [Rosardi et al., 2021, 2022](#); [Sihgiyanti, 2016](#)). Even though agriculture sector has potential, the policies have not been well organized and need to be re-evaluated. The success of a policy implementation is signified by an evaluation, through which not only the progress and but also the obstacles are scrutinized. In public policy, the last stage is policy evaluation where conducting evaluation plays an important stage to determine what the next action will be and how to handle the program being developed ([Daisuke, 2018](#); [de Vos & Delabre, 2018](#); [Hasbullah & Annam, 2019](#); [Widiati et al., 2020](#)).

It can be stated further that any policies are considered successful if they are evaluated continuously, thus conceptually evaluating policies is to determine the effectiveness of achieving goals, whether it succeeds or fails, and this will be a follow up evaluation for an improvement in the future ([Achmad & Mendoza, 2017](#); [Damanik & Marom, 2016](#)). In addition, ([Kasami, 2021](#)) mentioned that an evaluated policy helps measure both the optimum implementation and

the level of compliance of policy implementers. It is also important to evaluate policies by taking into account the situation and conditions of an organization where the policy is being implemented ([Astuti et al., 2022](#); [Boossabong & Taylor, 2009](#); [Chow, 2018](#); [Gusa, 2019](#)).

Moreover, an evaluation aims to find out the advantages and disadvantages of a policy that has been implemented ([Erlambang, 2022](#)). By knowing both the advantages and disadvantages of these policies, there will be internal and external improvements to achieve the planned goals in the future ([Sihombing & Bangun, 2022](#)). Lastly, a policy evaluation aims to find out whether or not the implementation is effective, so it serves as a basis for improvement and correction ([As'ari et al., 2017](#)).

Agriculture plays an important role in the overall national economy. It is shown by the number of people who live and work in the agricultural sector or by the total of the national products generated from agricultural activities. In fact, agriculture is not only an economic activity to yield income for farmers but also a way of life for most of them. Therefore, in the agricultural system and sector, farmers are considered the main actors ([Jones et al., 2010](#); [Kutlvař et al., 2020](#); [Mwakaje, 2012](#); [Pantjar Simatupang, 2003](#)).

Agriculture in a broad sense is better known as a system of crop production. In terms of the type of production land, crops production systems are divided into two groups, namely crop production systems in wetlands (*lowland*) and on dry land (*upland*). Meanwhile, in terms of the cultivated plants, there are several types of crop production systems, among others are food crops production systems (rice and pulses), horticultural crops production systems, plantation crops production systems, and contemporary crops production systems, such as hydroponics, integrated farming, and organic farming production systems ([Abdul et al., 2022](#); [de Vos, 2018](#); [Herrmann et al., 2016](#); [Zhou et al., 2021](#)).

One of the government policies in the city of Tidore Islands is to assist farmers with plantation plant seeds. The seed assistance policy is in the context of developing community plantation commodities in rural areas, especially in Oba District, where the majority are plantation farmers and the land area is still favourable if compared to other sub-districts. In addition, people are accustomed to plantation agriculture, therefore an investigation is needed to find out the success of the seeds provision policy for agricultural sector in the area ([Siscawati & Soetjipto, 2020](#)).

A garden is a plant resource for nature resilience to prevent the global warming issue, thus all parties involved should be encouraged to manage the garden properly. The garden resource can be annual or annual plants, where the types and the management objectives are considered production of the secondary needs, not the primary ones.

Annuals are plant species harvested only once within a life cycle of a year. On the other hand, annual plants such as rubber, cocoa plant, clove, palm oil, coffee, and pepper require more time to produce to as long as ten years period, yet the harvests can be generated more than once. As for the forms of agricultural land in Indonesia, these include rice fields, fields, yards, shifting fields, and others. There are diverse products from agriculture in Indonesia such as rice, coffee, corn, onions, tomatoes, cloves, cocoa, avocado, beans, cotton, cotton, rubber, cinnamon, soybeans, coconut, palm oil, potatoes, sweet potatoes, sweet potatoes, sago, and many others.

The City of Tidore Islands is one of the areas in Indonesia with a very large agricultural land. The land is dominated by coconut plantations. The majority of people residing in 8 sub-districts, 40 sub-districts, and 49 villages work as farmers. In addition, it is one of the cities where the areas are promising and potential for both plantation and food agriculture. The management however, has not been optimum yet, therefore other regions become the suppliers for the community's basic needs.

As stated in the Regional Long Term Development Plan (RPJMD or Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah) for the years 2020-2025, the City of Tidore Islands is very potential and the cultivation areas for agricultural purposes is around 320,026.45 Ha (hectares). The area covers 644 Ha of Wetland and 34,614 Ha of Dry Land with horticultural cultivation areas, plantations, food crops, and animal husbandry. Horticultural cultivation areas are for produce such as avocado, orange, mango, olive/duke, durian, papaya, pineapple, banana, jackfruit, rambutan, salak, rice, corn, cassava, peanuts, soybeans, green beans, tubers, and vegetables.

Meanwhile, the Strategic Plan (Renstra or Rencana Strategis) document for the Agriculture Office of the City of Tidore Islands states that the increase in production, productivity, and quality of agricultural plantations and food crops stipulated in the performance measurement indicates the target performance indicators to reach 100 percent, in other words, the target has been achieved. On the other hand, in the Government Regulation Number 26, 2022 concerning the Implementation of the Agricultural Sector, parties such as Farmer Groups, Association of Farmer Groups (Gapoktan or Gabungan Kelompok Tani), Farmer Economic Institutions, and Cooperatives have a significant role. However, for the City of Tidore Islands, the agricultural institution have not been involved in formulating or carrying out the development in agricultural sector. In addition, the agricultural potency in each village/sub-districts has not been thoroughly identified. The primary activity carried out by the institution is solely on distributing agricultural seeds, therefore this is considered to be less productive

Further analyses indicate that the problem the city of Tidore Islands encounters is in the mapping of the agriculture, plantations, food for villages and sub-districts potentials. As a consequence, it is difficult to obtain the valid data. This research is conducted in the context of realizing Tidore with one data as stated in the 2021-2025 Tidore Islands City RPJMD (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah or Regional Mid-Term Development Plan). The need for mapping the potentials in villages/sub-districts to maximize the processing of agricultural, plantation, and food products for the City of Tidore Islands serves as the background of the study. Later on, the information regarding the agricultural, plantation, and food potential of the city can be used as a reference for local government policies and other related service programs in the future. It is expected that the setting up of the policies and the programs are on target.

## METHODS

This is a qualitative research with a case study approach, since such approach is flexible for researchers to make necessary changes in the research process ([Moleong & J., 2014](#); [Stake, 1995](#)). The main objective is to measure the capacity of the local governments in carrying out their development functions in the regions and to find out how the participants share their views on

the existing problems. As an approach, the key to a case study research is to investigate a particular event, situation, or social condition and to provide insights into the process, thus analyzing how a particular event or situation occurs.

Purposive sampling as a criterion for selecting participants is implemented. The participants are 35 people classified into three levels, namely officials in the City of Tidore Islands consisting of the Mayor, Regional Secretary, head of the service, and section head who have information about the development of the Payahe transmigration area. Additionally, officials in the North Maluku provincial government and the officials in several ministries in charge of both development and development of the transmigration area are involved.

Before the interview process is carried out, a research permit from the Investment and One-Stop Integrated Service Agency (BPMP'TSP or Badan Penanaman Modal Dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu) of the City of Tidore Islands is proposed. The issuance of the research permit from BPMP'TSP is addressed to the agency where interviews with participants will be conducted. After receiving the letter from BPMP'TSP, it is sent to the intended agency through the General Section (BU) of each institution, to obtain a disposition or to ensure the participants are willing to be interviewed. It takes 24 hours for the application of the research permit to process, whereas the period of one week up to one month is needed for the approval or disposition of the participants. As the administration is fulfilled and the approval is granted, an appointment to conduct face-to-face interviews with participants is made. It is a recorded interview with the duration of 60 to 90 minutes.

The data collection procedure is carried out through in-depth interviews with participants using interview guidelines in Indonesian forms. The interview results are then translated into English, based on the focus and theme of the research and the answers from the participants in the field. Numeric as a substitute for the participant's name is used, whereas information concerning the official institution is not mentioned. Participants' names are with initials, so as to maintain the confidentiality of both the agency and participants.

Next is on the data analyses. The data analysis used in this research is interactive qualitative by classifying the thematic forms ([Miles & Huberman, 1992](#)) and is carried out through data reduction. In this stage, the research process of selecting and simplifying the raw data emerged during the interviews with participants is conducted. After that, the data are sorted: those relevant to the research focus are maintained and the rest irrelevant to the research themes are discarded. The next procedure is narrating the data in a text form. Based on Miles and Huberman's data analysis, two themes are created, they are: (1) Local political influence, (2). Local government budget constraints.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The study on the plantation development in Oba District, Tidore Islands City as reflected in the Regional Medium Term Plan (RPJMD) for the 2021-2026 period has shown a crucial result. Oba District is established as a new center for the economic growth through the concept of transmigration area development. This is due to the contribution given in the agricultural sector

where the economic condition of the community improves. Therefore, it can be emphasized that the development in agriculture, plantations and food is a series of activities aimed at increasing the society's standard of living, providing the employment opportunities, improving the equity, and maintaining the price stability. A number of efforts such as the enhancements to the rate of the economic growth signified by an equal distribution of prosperity, a better inter-regional economic relations, and an increase in the quality of resources to make people more productive help the local government achieve the goals.

Based on the description of the land suitability analysis, Oba District have the potency of food, horticultural, and plantation crop commodities to develop. The area, blessed with diverse bio-physical characteristics of the land, supporting infrastructure, and agro-ecology, can vary the cultivation of the agricultural commodities in each village. Therefore, it is necessary to select which particular commodities to develop, as it can be a driving force for the development of the community economy.

The leading commodities are mainstay commodities which are potential to be developed in a region based on technical considerations. The determination is important because of the availability and ability of the natural resources, the capital, and humans to produce and market all commodities. Besides, Oba District has a transmigration area that can be encouraged to develop superior horticultural commodities for the production of various types of plants. Selecting the leading commodities is necessary in order to set up the priorities, which various potential commodities are to be intensified.

**Table 1. Main Plantation Commodities in Oba District for the 2018-2022 period**

| No | Comm odities | 2018               |                | 2019            |                    | 2020           |                 | 2021               |                | 2022            |                    |                |                 |     |     |     |
|----|--------------|--------------------|----------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------|-----------------|-----|-----|-----|
|    |              | Plant ed Area (Ha) | Harvested (Ha) | Production (Kg) | Plant ed Area (Ha) | Harvested (Ha) | Production (Kg) | Plant ed Area (Ha) | Harvested (Ha) | Production (Kg) | Plant ed Area (Ha) | Harvested (Ha) | Production (Kg) |     |     |     |
| 1  | 2            | 3                  | 4              | 5               | 6                  | 7              | 8               | 9                  | 10             | 11              | 12                 | 13             | 14              | 15  | 16  | 17  |
| 1  | Cloves       | 47                 | 0              | 0               | 52                 | 38             | 266             | 55                 | 0              | 0               | 59                 | 0              | 0               | 63  | 0   | 0   |
| 2  | Nutme g      | 10                 | 31             | 157             | 11                 | 38             | 190             | 125                | 57.            | 287             | 12                 | 52             | 2600            | 14  | 71  | 355 |
|    |              | 6.5                | .7             | 50              | 6                  |                | 00              | .3                 | 5              | 50              | 5                  |                | 0               | 4   |     | 00  |
| 3  | Cocon ut     | 19                 | 14             | 981             | 19                 | 14             | 995             | 191                | 14             | 101             | 19                 | 14             | 9947            | 19  | 16  | 117 |
|    |              | 21                 | 02             | 400             | 20.                | 22             | 400             | 8                  | 53             | 710             | 15                 | 21             | 00              | 14. | 78  | 460 |
|    |              |                    |                |                 | 5                  |                |                 |                    |                | 0               |                    |                |                 | 7   |     | 0   |
| 4  | Cocoa        | 8                  | 1.             | 105             | 7.3                | 1.3            | 910             | 6.9                | 1.2            | 875             | 6.1                | 1.0            | 728             | 5.2 | 1.0 | 714 |
|    |              | 5                  | 0              | 0               |                    |                |                 |                    | 5              |                 |                    | 4              |                 | 5   | 2   |     |

Data source: Oba District Agricultural Extension Center, 2022

Table 1 shows the main plantation commodities in Oba sub-district. There are some superior plantations such as coconut, nutmeg, cloves, and coffee. Based on the production data, coconut and nutmeg commodities increase every year, whereas cocoa experiences a decrease, both in the planting area and the production. This is due to the residents' land being converted to coconut, nutmeg, and cloves plantations.

The results of the study indicate that Oba District has good potency and prospects for the development of the agricultural sector including food crops and estate crops, which result in abundant food. A number of plantation and horticultural crops have been cultivated by the people in Oba District. Some of these agricultural commodities have very promising potency and economic prospects for further development due to its land suitability, productivity, community acceptance, and market opportunities.

The plantation crop commodities cultivated by residents in Oba District are Coconut, Nutmeg, Cocoa, Cloves, and Coffee. In fact, commodities such as coconut, Cocoa, and Nutmeg have a high economic value to be developed, for it is supported by land suitability and agro-ecology. However, the two potential commodities, coconut and nutmeg are of great interest to the majority of people in Oba District. For generations, the commodities have been considered to have a better economic prospect and bigger market opportunities, not only at the national but also at the international levels. Unfortunately, until this study has been conducted, no investors to develop coconut (copra) plantations have put their interests.

### The Policy for Community Seed Assistance

From the results of the interviews with various informants, it is found that the City Government of Tidore Islands through its Agriculture Service has provided agricultural seed assistance to farmers such as nutmeg, clove, and coconut seeds. The agricultural seeds are part of a plantation development program in the City of Tidore Islands, where the majority of people are plantation farmers. This assistance program is channeled through the Association of Farmers Groups (Gapoktan) formed in every village and sub-district.

The procedures for agricultural seeds assistance begins when Gapoktan submits a proposal to the Agriculture Service. The total amount of nutmeg, clove, and coconut seeds needed is specified by each farmer group (Poktan) a year earlier, to be budgeted by the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD or Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah). After budgeting for the following year, the Agriculture Service provides information to farmers through the Agricultural Extension Center (BPP or Badan Penyuluhan Pertanian) in each sub-district to recollect the data and verify potential recipients of plantation seeds. After the seeds are granted, they are then distributed to farmers through BPP.

However, from the interview results with farmers, the policy for agricultural seed assistance is not supported by the provisions of fertilizers, medicines, agricultural equipment and machinery. Therefore, after the plantation seeds are received, the farmers plant them using a traditional system, such as slashing and planting on their respective lands. In addition, officers at the agriculture Office of Tidore do not monitor and evaluate, whether or not the seeds have been planted, how they grow and how to maintain further.

### The Evaluation of Plantation Patterns

The results of research on plantation farmers in Oba District showed that the government provided seed assistance to farmers in order to grow crops. However, counselling is not provided, and farmers work conventionally by applying the cutting, slashing, and planting system with a minimum maintenance.

Furthermore, it is indicated that the seeds assistance is not supported by the provision of medicine and fertilizer, therefore, nutmeg, coconut, and clove seeds are planted conventionally without the help of technology. As a consequence, plants neither optimally bear fruit nor thrive, in addition to their being attacked by pests without an improved control system. The damaged grass caused by the attack of the pests is just cut and burnt.

In Oba District, there are two plantation patterns applied. The first is a monoculture cropping pattern with coconut commodity being the only variant planted in one land and the second, the polyculture cropping pattern with several types of plants. The common horticultural pattern in Oba district consists of two types of plants, coconut and nutmeg. Nevertheless, the monoculture pattern is chosen since the ownership of agricultural land is limited and the price of coconut commodities is fluctuated, thus planting nutmeg is chosen by the majority of farmers.

### The Evaluation of Marketing Patterns of Plantation Products

Some people are usually involved in the coconut processing. They collect, split or gouge the flesh. Initially, after the coconuts are collected, they are split in halves, then scraped using a cancel. After that, the coconut is dried by holding it in a smoking area before being used as copra. The copra is put in sacks, and measured using a particular scale before they are sold. The price per kilogram is IDR 6000, and each sack contains 75 kg to 80 kg of copra. As for the coconut belt and shell, they are let unused and become coconut waste.

Based on the results of this research, it can be understood that some farmers set the fixed selling price of the copra. It is possible since they manage a direct transaction with consumers and other buyers. Nevertheless, what they receive is not always commensurate with the results of the copra sold, particularly for the rest of farmers who do not know exactly what the selling price should be. In other words, as long as they generate something from their business, they do not have any objections with the gap between the cost incurred and the income received. The majority of farmers follow the copra price in the market. If the price of copra rises, so does the cost of labor. However, if the price of copra falls, the price of labor remains the same.

From the marketing aspect, coconut commodity (Copra) has a wider and better market demand both at home and abroad. The scope of the demand can be in the regional, national, and international markets. The transaction is also made easy, in which the collectors come directly to the farmers to buy the commodity, then the copra collectors proceed to major dealers in Ternate and Bitung who directly sell in large quantities to the processing factories.

As for the cacao commodity, it is stated that the people in Oba district also plant the cacao. The average cacao plant is between 5-6 years old and has produced an average of 450 kg of dry cocoa beans/ha, and the productivity per hectare will increase in accordance to the age of the plant. Meanwhile for the cloves, the average age of the plants is around 6-7 years and farmers can produce

around 500-550 kg per hectare. Similarly, with productivity per hectare continues to increase, cacao is another promising business for the farmers. It can be concluded that the cacao and cloves are potential to be superior commodities and they have a good prospect for future markets.

### The Evaluation of Plantation Productivity and Constraints

The role of the coconut plantation commodity in Oba District is very prominent and strategic considering its function as a source of income for farmers and the creation of jobs for farm laborers in the community. The study found that copra production was 926 tons per year in 2022. The calculation is, 1 Hectare of land produces 1 ton of copra and the average production is slightly different from year to year.

The Black copra is a by-product from coconut plantations in Oba District, but with a lower quality, if compared to white copra. Beside black copra, coconut has other derivative products such as sugar from coconut sap, shell charcoal, and coir fiber. When a coconut is used properly, the productivity of coconut plantations will also increase.

Currently, the constraints faced by coconut farmers are the unstable price of copra and the high production costs, as a result of the increased basic needs and fuel price. In fact, it takes a long time to change coconuts into copra. As a consequence, the needs for farm laborers' supplies and facilities such as meals, transportation fee, and daily wages should be carefully considered.

To increase the productivity of coconut and nutmeg plantations, the regional government should encourage assistance programs directly related to managing coconut and nutmeg plantations. Based on the field data, it can be stated that the government has provided assistance programs, unfortunately the assistance is not in line with that the needs of the Oba community.

### The Evaluation of the Distribution of Plantation Products

There are some distribution problems need considering. Exporting for instance, is not a simple procedure to carry out. Quality and packaging are crucial for farmers in order to win the international market. Coconut farmers in the district produce dried copra in a conventional way. They apply the smoking method, causing the copra to turn blackish brown. In addition, the processing time from coconut to copra is considerably long, thus the damage to the coconut occurs.

For local or national distribution, farmers in Oba Sub-District go through several stages to reach the company. The link is as follows: farmers bring the coconuts to the local entrepreneurs and the local entrepreneurs distribute the commodity to several companies such as the ones in Bitung and Surabaya, either by land or sea transportation modes. With the long distribution chain and the high distribution costs by local entrepreneurs, farmers earn lower. Farmers can only sell for IDR 5,300 per kilo, whereas the companies buy from the entrepreneurs for as high as IDR 8,900-9,000 per kilo. As farmers rely the selling process on entrepreneurs, they do not have a good bargaining position. For them, as long as they can fulfil their needs, they are prone to follow the distribution procedures.

In order to help improve the welfare of the coconut farmers and to break the winding distribution chain, the local government should set up the policy for luring investors to invest in the North Maluku region. The presence of the companies in the region where copra is purchased as raw



materials helps reduce the distribution costs between local entrepreneurs and companies, thus prices remain stable.

The other additional products such as nutmeg, mace and cloves contribute to the welfare of farmers. For nutmeg commodity, farmers sell the product to local entrepreneurs for IDR. 60,000 per kilogram, IDR 80,000 per kilo for mace and IDR 50,000 for cloves. However, for nutmeg and cloves, the handling pattern for farmers is different from copra. Local businessmen usually give a down payment to copra farmers. The money received is useful to support the farmers' daily needs. However, the down payment is not provided to clove and nutmeg farmers.

### CONCLUSIONS

After the study has been conducted, it can be concluded that the policy of assisting plantation seeds to farmers by the City government of Tidore Islands has been on target, yet it is not optimum since there is inadequate support, be it continuous guidance and thorough supervision, therefore farmers do not plant the seeds they have received accordingly. Another research finding shows that the role of Gapoktan in every village of Oba District is considered insignificant due to the limited access of information regarding the facilities and the infrastructure. As for the plantation pattern, most farmers apply the traditional patterns such as slashing, cutting, and planting, and chemical fertilizers is not used. In addition, pest control is conducted conventionally by burning dry leaves around the garden. It is apparent that there is no utilization in technology implemented.

Furthermore, farmers of copra, clove, and nutmeg work in a traditional way, implementing the old system through the utilization of simple agricultural tools. Another problem is with the process of distribution, where farmers are dependent on the local entrepreneurs. The road access is not supporting, and the cost of mobilizing the plantation products is quite high, as two kinds of transportation modes, land and sea should be taken.

### REFERENCES

- Abdul, I., Wulan Sari, D., Haryanto, T., & Win, T. (2022). Analysis of factors affecting the technical inefficiency on Indonesian palm oil plantation. *Scientific Reports*, 12(1).  
<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-07113-7>
- Achmad, B., & Mendoza, G. A. (2017). Comparison of community and government preferences in prioritizing suitable lands for sustainable tree plantations. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and World Ecology*, 24(4), 304–315.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13504509.2016.1228550>
- As'ari, H., Zulkarnaini, & Nasution, M. S. (2017). *Evaluation of Development Policies and Priorities in Efforts to Strengthen Community Economy*. *Journal of State Administration* (Vol. 17, Issue 2, pp. 109–123).
- Astuti, R., Miller, M. A., McGregor, A., Sukmara, M. D. P., Saputra, W., & Taylor, D. (2022). Making illegality visible: The governance dilemmas created by visualising illegal palm oil

- plantations in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Land Use Policy*, 114.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105942>
- Boossabong, P., & Taylor, M. F. (2009). Impact of trade liberalization on the agricultural sector and adjustment policy: The case of shallot plantations in Northeastern Thailand. *Kasetsart Journal - Social Sciences*, 30(3), 323–337. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-74549159087&partnerID=40&md5=467532c66a178365fc4c51dc52ff9fbc>
- Chow, J. (2018). Determinants of household fuelwood collection from mangrove plantations in coastal Bangladesh. *Forest Policy and Economics*, 96, 83–92.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forpol.2018.08.007>
- Daisuke, T. (2018). How accepting are swiddeners of oil palm plantation developments? Based on evidence from besiq village, Indonesia's province of east kalimantan. *Japanese Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 55(2), 320–345. [https://doi.org/10.20495/tak.55.2\\_320](https://doi.org/10.20495/tak.55.2_320)
- Damanik, Y. T., & Marom, A. (2016). Evaluation of Poverty Reduction Policy Through Skills Training Program in Mangunharjo Village, Tembalang District. *Semarang City Journal Of Public Policy And Management Review*, 1–11.
- de Vos, R. (2018). Counter-Mapping against oil palm plantations: reclaiming village territory in Indonesia with the 2014 Village Law. *Critical Asian Studies*, 50(4), 615–633.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/14672715.2018.1522595>
- de Vos, R., & Delabre, I. (2018). Spaces for participation and resistance: gendered experiences of oil palm plantation development. *Geoforum*, 96, 217–226.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2018.08.011>
- Erlambang, N. (2022). *Evaluation of the One District One Tourism Village Program (Study at the Tourism and Culture Office of Lumajang Regency)*. PUBLICIAN (Vol. 15, Issue 02, pp. 66–80).
- Gusa, P. S. (2019). The Effect of Policy Evaluation on Employee Performance. JISIP. *Journal of Social and Political Sciences*, 8(4), 325–328.
- Hasbullah, & Annam, S. (2019). Evaluation of the Zoning System Policy in PPDB at the State Junior High School Level in. *Pamekasan Regency.Reform Journal*, 112.
- Hassan, B., Bhattacharjee, M., & Wani, S. A. (2020). Economic analysis of high-density apple plantation scheme in Jammu and Kashmir. *Asian Journal of Agriculture and Rural Development*, 10(1), 379–391. <https://doi.org/10.18488/journal.1005/2020.10.1/1005.1.379.391>
- Herrmann, L., Bräu, L., Robin, A., Robain, H., Wiriyakitnateekul, W., & Lesueur, D. (2016). High colonization by native arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) of rubber trees in small-holder plantations on low fertility soils in North East Thailand. *Archives of Agronomy and Soil Science*, 62(7), 1041–1048. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03650340.2015.1110238>
- Jones, P. D., Grado, S. C., & Demarais, S. (2010). Financial analysis of intensive pine plantation establishment. *Journal of Forest Economics*, 16(2), 101–112.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfe.2009.09.001>

- Kasami, S. (2021). Evaluation of Health Protocol Policy in the Prevention and Control of Covid-19 (A Study in Sumbang Village, Bojonegoro District. *Bojonegoro Regency*). *Scientific Journal of State Administration*, 30–34.
- Kutlvař, J., Baroš, A., Pyšek, P., & Pergl, J. (2020). Changes in assemblages of native and alien plants in perennial plantations: prairie species stabilize the community composition. *NeoBiota*, 63, 39–56. <https://doi.org/10.3897/neobiota.63.51109>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1992). *Qualitative Data Analysis (Qualitative Data Analysis*. UI Press.
- Moleong, & J., L. (2014). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. Edisi Revisi*. PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mwakaje, A. G. (2012). Can Tanzania realise rural development through biofuel plantations? Insights from the study in Rufiji District. *Energy for Sustainable Development*, 16(3), 320–327. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2012.07.001>
- Pantjar Simatupang, B. I. (2003). Control of cropland conversion. *A Review of Perennial Cropland Policies. Proceedings of the Multifunction National Seminar and Agricultural Land Conversion*, 67–83.
- Rosardi, R. G., Prajanti, S. D. W., & Atmaja, H. T. (2021). Sustainable tourism model in pagilaran tea plantation agrotourism, in Indonesia. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 16(5), 981–990. <https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.160519>
- Rosardi, R. G., Prajanti, S. D. W., Atmaja, H. T., & Yanti, D. (2022). Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy with AHP (Analytical Hierarchy Process) Method in Pagilaran Tea Plantation Agrotourism, Indonesia. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 17(4), 1317–1327. <https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.170429>
- Sihgiyanti, V. J. (2016). Evaluation of the Implementation of the Urban Farming Program by the Department of Agriculture in the City of Surabaya. *Public. Policy and Management*, 4(2), 264–272.
- Sihombing, F. D., & Bangun, M. (2022). OMBUDSMAN Policy Evaluation in Improving Public Services in North Sumatra. *JOURNAL. MESSAGE COMMUNICATION*, 11(1), 23–33.
- Siscawati, M., & Soetjipto, A. W. (2020). Multi-layered exclusions of women heads of household over land: Case study on ex-plantation concession area in Nanggung village, Nanggung sub-district, Bogor regency, West Java Province, Indonesia. *Asian Women*, 36(2), 97–120. <https://doi.org/10.14431/aw.2020.6.36.2.97>
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks, United States.
- Widiati, W., Mulyadi, A., & Syahza, A. (2020). Analysis of plantation management achievement based on sustainable development. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 15(4), 575–584. <https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.150418>
- Zhou, X., Wang, A., Hobbie, E. A., Zhu, F., Qu, Y., Dai, L., Li, D., Liu, X., Zhu, W., Koba, K., Li, Y., & Fang, Y. (2021). Mature conifers assimilate nitrate as efficiently as ammonium

from soils in four forest plantations. *New Phytologist*, 229(6), 3184–3194.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.17110>